

**New York State (NYS)
Workforce Investment Board (SWIB)
Quarterly Meeting Minutes**

Call to Order

A quarterly meeting of the NYS SWIB was held on October 9, 2024, at the NYS Department of Labor (NYS DOL) in Albany, as well as at public videoconference sites in Buffalo, Hicksville, New York City, Rochester, and Syracuse. The meeting was called to order at 3:08 PM and was presided over by SWIB Chair Dawn Burlew.

Attendees

Members in Attendance:

- Quinn Rapp-Ellis (Proxy for Governor Kathy Hochul)
- Chris White (Proxy for NYSDOL Commissioner Roberta Reardon)
- Ashley McCloskey (Proxy for ESD Commissioner Hope Knight)
- NYSED Deputy Commissioner Ceylane Meyers-Ruff (Proxy for NYSED Commissioner Betty A. Rosa)
- OTDA Commissioner Barbara C. Guinn
- Tonya Boniface (Proxy for OCFS Commissioner Dr. DaMia Harris-Madden)
- Assemblymember Harry Bronson (in Rochester)
- Assemblymember Al Stirpe (in Syracuse)
- Chair Dawn Burlew
- Rose Duhan
- Greg Lancette
- Tony Baird
- Melissa Fleischut
- Dan McGraw
- Amy Desjardins
- Norb Fuest
- Patricia Fusco
- Katie Geise
- Harold King
- Annmarie Lanese
- Todd Trantum
- Rick Plympton (in Rochester)
- Zach Arnold (in Rochester)
- Jessica Johnson-Cope (in NYC)
- Kim Townsend (in Syracuse)

Members Not In Attendance:

- Johanna Duncan Poitier (Proxy for SUNY Chancellor John B. King)
- Senator Sean Ryan
- Senator Jessica Ramos
- Albert Catalano
- John Durso
- David Mathis
- Sergio Esteban
- Shawna Papale
- Florence McCue

Announcements

1. **Welcome and Introductions** – SWIB Chair Dawn Burlew welcomed everyone to the meeting and thanked members for their continued dedication to the Board. The meeting was live streamed and there was no public testimony during the meeting.

2. **Members and Proxies** – Members and proxies around the room and via videoconference site introduced themselves. There was a quorum at the meeting.

Motions

There were two (2) items to vote on; the first was the draft Meeting Minutes from the July 24, 2024 meeting and the second was a motion to approve a SWIB Vice Chair.

1. **SWIB Meeting Minutes Voting:**

- a. July Meeting Minutes – Chair Dawn Burlew moved to accept the meeting minutes as final and Katie Geise seconded. There was no discussion and all members voted in favor.

2. **SWIB Vice Chair Voting:**

- a. Approval of a SWIB Vice Chair – A motion carried to name a Member to serve as the Vice Chair and assist the Chair in carrying out their duties should they not be able to attend the meeting. Todd Tranum was recommended as Vice Chair. There was no discussion and all members voted in favor.

New Business

1. **Committee Report Outs** – The Chair of each of the three (3) Committees below provided updates on the work they have been doing. Key points included:

- a. **Executive Committee** – Chair Dawn Burlew provided a brief update on the SWIB’s Executive Committee meeting held on September 23, 2024, and discussed adding a Vice Chair to the SWIB.

- b. **Career and Industry Committee** – Annmarie Lanese provided an update on the Career and Industry Committee’s meeting held on September 20, 2024. Key updates included:

The Committee is currently working on two (2) projects. The first is determining how to support local area non-degree credential and certificate programs. Many credentials are posted on the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL), but some of the local areas may not fund them. There are also credentials available that are not considered post-secondary or industry-recognized. NYSDOL plans on developing a Technical Advisory (TA) related to this and will provide some questions on credentials the Committee can consider for the local areas. The Committee reported considering an advisory board to help with this task.

The second project is the development of a resource map to help both employers and individuals looking for services and trainings in NYS. This resource map will help individuals understand all the opportunities they can access. While there is a huge need for English as a Second Language (ESL) courses, employers really do not know how or where to access these types of training programs, so creating a resource map will be really helpful. The Committee stated they may also consider an advisory board assist with this task, along with a Communications Committee to help reach as wide an audience as possible.

- c. **Strategic Investments and Evaluation Committee** – Katie Geise and Justin Heinbuch, NYSDOL Workforce Programs Manager, provided an update on the work of the Committee. Key points included:

As discussed during the July 24, 2024 SWIB meeting, the Committee was working with NYSDOL on Customer Satisfaction Surveys for both businesses and job seekers. After

additional discussions between the Committee and NYSDOL, the Job Seeker survey was updated to specific surveys for walk-in customers, for customers that had a mandatory Unemployment Insurance (UI) appointment, and for customers that were utilizing self-service (i.e., using the Career Center Resource Rooms for job search). All four (4) surveys were finalized in late August 2024. The surveys were emailed to identified businesses and job seekers on September 10, 2024, and the deadline for completion was September 24, 2024.

Justin Heinbuch shared the preliminary survey results and some of the trends found. Self-service job seekers tended to have a lower response rate and overwhelmingly, the results were positive, especially with business customers. When it came to how satisfied job seekers were with services, 60-70% responded with an 8 or above (on a scale of 1 to 10, with 10 being the most satisfied and 1 being the least satisfied). The following contains a summary of each of the four (4) Customer Satisfaction surveys:

- i. **Businesses** – Sent to businesses with an email address on file and that received assistance from the Career Center System between July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024.
 - o The survey was sent to 37,830 businesses; 617 responses with a 97% completion rate.
 - o When it came to what industry the business primarily operates in, the top three (3) responses included Manufacturing (21.2%), Health Care (9.8%), and Construction (9%).
- ii. **Job Seekers with Mandatory Appointments** – Sent to customers collecting UI and required to receive reemployment services, who were served between July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024.
 - o The survey was sent to 91,963 job seekers; 1,996 responses with a 99% completion rate.
 - o When it came to age ranges, 44.5% were between 56-70, 31.1% were between 41-55, and 14.7% were between 25-40.
 - o The top services received include Job Search Assistance (56.5%), UI Claim Assistance (51.5%), and Career Guidance (35.8%).
 - o Nearly 70% indicated they are somewhat or very likely to recommend Career Center Services or to use them again.
- iii. **Job Seekers-Self-Service (Not Mandatory)** – Sent to customers that utilized a Career Center resource room or self-services only between July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024.
 - o The survey was sent to 22,683 job seekers; 226 responses with a 100% completion rate.
 - o When it came to age ranges, 38.2% were between the ages of 56-70, 32% were between 41-55, and 20.9% were between 25-40.
 - o The top three (3) purposes for the visit included Obtain Information on UI and Apply for Jobs (both at 34.7%), Apply for UI (32.9%), and use the Resource Room to Job Search (25.8%).
 - o Over 60% indicated they are somewhat or very likely to recommend Career Services or use them again.

- iv. **Job Seekers-Walk-In (Not Mandatory)** – Sent to customers not required to attend a mandatory UI reemployment service, who received services from a Career Center between July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024.
- The survey was sent to 122,652 job seekers; 1,660 responses with a 99% completion rate.
 - The top three (3) age ranges were 32.9% between the ages of 41-55, 27.9% between the ages of 56-70, and 26.9% between the ages of 25-40.
 - The top three (3) reasons for the visit were Job Search (56.7%), Job Interview/Job Fair (25.6%), and Job Recruitment (21.4%).
 - Over 60% indicated that they are somewhat or very likely to recommend Career Center services or use them again.

Many of the positive comments were directed at specific staff or a group that they worked with; this tells us how important those relationships are in their career journey towards self-sustaining employment.

Jessica Johnson-Cope – Where do you see potential gaps in missing opportunities with both job seekers and businesses that are not tech savvy and may not have access to email/internet or know how to best use them?

NYSDOL Response – This is a reminder of the breadth of customers we are serving and the breadth of services that are still needed at a time when yes, we still have to train and think about artificial intelligence (AI). We cannot lose track of the very successful analogue programs out there that are still providing good success stories. How do we determine a sustainability plan for still having fax machines that work, and having those in-person connections that are successful while at the same time, helping to navigate the modern world of technology?

Barbara Guinn – For the mandatory appointment survey responses, when asked which Career Center are you receiving services from, did it seem to be from smaller areas as opposed to urban centers? I would have expected heavier responses from New York City.

NYSDOL Response – For the question asking, “What county do you reside in,” the top three (3) responses were Nassau County (12.6%), Erie County (6.9%), and Suffolk County (6.4%).

Correction: New York County (Manhattan) was at 12.6%, so should be listed with Nassau County for the top response.

For the question, “Which One-Stop Career Center is the staff where you worked with from,” the top three (3) responses were Hicksville Career Center (6.4%), New York City Workforce 1 Career Center (3.9%), and the Hempstead Works Career Center (3.8%).

Rose Duhan – Was there a match between the distance traveled to the Career Center and the location of the Center?

NYSDOL Response – We can match up these responses; that is one of the things we plan to explore further and to also identify trends.

2. **New York State Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) Presentation** – Nora Yates, Deputy Commissioner of the Division of Child Care Services at OCFS discussed federal and state funding being dedicated to child care. Key points included:

- a. The Division of Child Care Services oversees and regulates the 17,000 child care programs in NYS and oversees the Child Care Assistance Program ([CCAP](#)), a subsidy program, that affords low and low-to-middle income families with low, free, or low-cost child care.
- b. Seventy percent (70%) of working families use some sort of child care in NYS. The total population in NYS is over 19M and roughly 4M children are within the age range for child care services (children with special needs and under court supervision can receive care up to age 18). However, NYS licensed/registered programs only have the capacity to serve just over 780,000 children.
- c. The child care landscape in NYS consists of 17,371 licensed/registered/permitted child care programs statewide, including NYC day care centers:
 - i. Day care centers: approximately 4,200 programs;
 - ii. Family day care homes: approximately 2,600 programs;
 - iii. Group family day care homes: approximately 7,800 programs; and
 - iv. School age child care programs: approximately 2,800 programs.
- d. In less than two (2) years, the income eligibility for child care has increased by nearly 70% for the CCAP. In 2022, it went from \$55,000 for a family of four (4), to today, which is \$99,000 for a family of four (4). The income eligibility just increased a couple months ago to \$109,000 for a family of four (4). This is a shift to a wider universe for families and this will go up every year with state median income. The NYS executive budget provides an approximately \$1.8B investment for CCAP with an increase last year of \$753M to support the expansion. We are state-supervised and locally administered, so our local Social Service District offices administer the CCAP.
- e. In establishing child care need, 60% of NYS is considered a child care desert, meaning there are more than three (3) children for every one (1) available child care spot. We were able to target an investment of grants to open the programs to those most in need of child care. We awarded 286 grants and expanded capacity by 7,000 slots or seats in those parts of the state where we needed to see it. We opened a center in the North Country, which was only the second center that was opened in recent years. We are still seeing large gaps in child care and this made just a drop in the bucket in Central New York and in the North Country on the amount of need that is there.
- f. There are also physical space concerns and Governor Kathy Hochul included \$50M in the Budget for capital awards where we worked with our partners at the Dormitory Authority of the State of New York.
- g. In previous years there was an investment in a Business Navigator Program. NYC developed a navigation guidebook, and we will model our statewide guidebook after this. We are working with the Early Care & Learning [Council](#) to create a guidebook that has specifics per region. We will do a series of webinars and kick-off events and have businesses present to ask questions such as, “Did the business help underwrite the cost of child care?” and “Did they physically invest in building a child care?” It makes sense to retain those good employees, given that 70% of them have at some point in their life had child care concerns. The next webinars will be held on October 24, 2024 from 10:30AM – 11:30AM and November 20, 2024 from 3:30PM – 4:30PM.

Tony Baird – Are you having a problem with staffing more than anything else? How will that be developed, especially with Micron coming to Central New York.

OCFS Response – NYSDOL Commissioner Reardon and OCFS Commissioner Dr. DaMia Harris-Madden are co-chairing the Governor’s Child Care Availability [Task Force](#), along with many other partners. Micron did come to present in how they are approaching moving to the area and investing in the workforce. We are working with Micron to do workforce pipeline projects so students can get credit for early childhood credentials in high school. How do we get the program investments so that employers can pay child care workers better and can give them health insurance, etc.? For CCAP we continue to raise rates that go to programs for these benefits. We should make sure we are providing professional development opportunities to really invest these dollars back into the program.

Todd Trantum – When you speak to some of the community colleges that are involved, are there efforts within these facilities for child care (i.e., to have those students learn and help take care of the children at the facility)?

OCFS Response – The State University of New York (SUNY) is invested in opening child care programs at SUNY and specifically linking this to their early childhood programs so that students can get their internship hours as part of their higher education. We have an infrastructure of 35 community-based organizations (CBOs) that coordinate these child care programs at the local level.

- h. If any of your employees might be eligible for the CCAP, they can go to ocfs.ny.gov/ccap to access the eligibility questionnaire. If eligible you can complete an online application on the website. We have partnered with NYSDOL on the NYS Job Bank so programs can post their openings. We are also working on a workforce development website for school-aged child care programs.
- i. NYSDOL Child Care Job Assistance includes:
- A new Child Care Opportunities [Job Bank](#) specific to supporting child care programs in finding qualified candidates;
 - Child care programs can obtain assistance virtually via the phone, web, or email; or in-person at local Career Centers;
 - Locate your nearest [NYSDOL Career Center](#) – For larger organizations that need to recruit multiple workers, NYSDOL can assist with organizing recruitment events and career fairs, or even participating in already scheduled events; and
 - NYSDOL’s Recruit Your Workforce [webpage](#) and NYSDOL’s Business Engagement Overview ([video](#) and [webinar slides](#)).

Amy Desjardins – The Workforce Development Institute (WDI) was awarded a small scholarship program for people who are over the income level for county subsidies. We go up to 400% income level, so those numbers that Nora showed were large for a family of four (4) and ours are a little bit more than that. The scholarship program is for people who are ineligible for county subsidies, so recent migrants would be eligible.

Annamarie Lanese – Can you talk about federal trends? Are states getting support at the federal level?

OCFS Response – We have a federal grant and our state funding, but it is all together in one fund. All the federal requirements apply to all the state funding as well. The state receives the Child Care Development Fund block grant through the federal government, which is for our licensing requirements. We have seen stable investment over recent years.

Chris White – Are there innovative models that have been around for a while or that are new today?

Rose Duhan – Something that has come up is that some of our call centers are very small and so they could not operate on their own, but they have talked about coming together on a joint project to have a child care center.

Katie Geise – We have tried to use some of our youth focused programs to develop work sites for our paid work experience program with child care providers so that we are building that entry level pipeline by encouraging young people to explore a job in child care. Locally we have done a great job on healthcare, but child care is a lot tougher to show as a career ladder. How do we identify clear career ladders? What certifications are needed and how can we help young people or current employees get those next level credentials?

Jessica Johnson-Cope – Are there any resources available to employers if they have the capacity to either create child care offerings at a central location that is close to a working facility for a parent? What resources are available for employers that want to come up with creative ideas for child care offerings?

OCFS Response – That would be the Business Navigator Toolkit I mentioned, which will be out shortly. There is a wonderful NYC Toolkit that provides all the ways you may be able to do it, whether you want to physically have a center or have one off-site. There are many models for this in addition to the state’s CCAP, which you can refer families to as well.

Ceylaine Meyers-Ruff – Regarding the career paths, there is a shortage of paraprofessional positions and other positions within education so there could be a direct pipeline to those other professions.

OCFS Response – The Office of Early Learning is working primarily with pre-K and there is a fluidity between the pre-K system and the child care system. We have a collaboration council with OCFS and the New York State Education Department (NYSED) that meets quarterly on these issues.

Patricia Fusco – Is there a program in place for pre-tax dollars for child care?

OCFS Response – There are programs that employers offer and there is a tax program at both the federal and state levels that not many take advantage of.

- 3. The Business Council of NYS** – Paul Zuber, Executive Vice President of the Business Council of NYS, discussed the initiatives that the Business Council has been working on. Key points included:
- a. The Business Council is the largest business association in NYS, representing about 3,200 members from Buffalo to Long Island, ranging from small businesses to minority owned businesses and mid-sized businesses to fortune 500 companies. This gives us a very diverse look at what our members are asking for and what the employment needs are for our members. Our job is to educate our members and the public, and to advocate for our members before state agencies, the Legislature, and the Governor.
 - b. The U.S. Chamber of Commerce has been seeing a workforce shortage, with numbers showing 8.2M open jobs. How do we bring people into the workforce? We know Baby Boomers are aging out and Generations X, Y, and Z are not keeping up with the Baby Boomers, so what parts of the NYS population can we get back into the workforce?

Something we worked on around this is the Clean Slate legislation, which would seal someone’s record who had a felony or misdemeanor conviction. One (1) in three (3) Americans have a criminal conviction record. We worked on this legislation very

aggressively and many of our members were involved with the Second Chance Coalition where businesses would actively recruit formerly incarcerated individuals to come and work for them. The success of that program was astounding.

With the Clean Slate bill, we have been working on actively getting a different segment of the population into the workforce. Going forward, we have been working with the Legislature and the Governor's Office on visiting locations across the state to educate them about Clean Slate.

We have also been working on the "benefits cliff". When taking a job is going to be more costly to you than losing the benefits you are getting right now, it does not make sense to get a job. And a lot of that has to do with child care costs. We have been working on a bill that would allow us to study the benefits cliff, and on legislation that would extend the six (6)-month income disregard for individuals receiving certain subsidies.

Recently we have been working with the Black and Latino Caucus on a bill called the Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC), which is a federal program that provides a tax credit to employers who hire from certain communities that have historically been left out of the economy. This gives an incentive for our members to actively seek and hire this population.

We have also been working on how to get the immigrant population into the workforce. There are some constraints as to who employers can hire based on their documented status, but working with NYSDOL has been something that the Business Council has actively pursued. We are also a charter member, along with the American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations (AFL-CIO), of the [Ellis Island Initiative](#), where we try to educate the public about immigration, the resources that exist for this population, and how we can get them jobs. It has been a very effective tool to reach out to this community that needs jobs.

- c. Child care has been another big issue for us. How do we get more people into the workforce by allowing them to send their kids to a child care facility? The cost of child care is keeping people out of the workforce. Our CEO, Heather Mulligan, was part of the Child Care Task Force, and we are going to continue to work with the Legislature on opportunities to create a universal child care program.
- d. Educating our members and the public is key to us. Crystal Griffith has taken a lead on working with our members and NYS on pathways to technology programs (i.e., working with SUNY on micro-credential programs), and we are seeing Governor Kathy Hochul take an aggressive approach in creating an economy that grows out of the chip fab industry. You do not need a college education or master's degree to work in some of the high paying jobs within the chip industry. How do we continue to create pathways to technology programs in advanced manufacturing? We are traveling the state, highlighting the manufacturing industry, which allows us to hear the needs of our members.
- e. We will also be working on creating opportunities as AI continues to grow. How do we train the next generation of young people in AI so that it can create jobs and not be something that causes a loss of jobs?
- f. Most importantly, we are starting the blue print for NYS. Over the next few months, we will have regional meetings across the state where we talk to business associations and anyone who has a stake in the economy to discuss what needs to get done to create a stronger NYS economy. This will help the Legislature and Governor to grow jobs and the economy. You are all welcome to be part of this discussion.

Tony Baird – Are there things you have in place to help support an employee who has a criminal past?

Paul Zuber – That is something we are still looking into. We want people to come into these jobs, but we want them to also stay in these jobs. For the issues involving the formerly incarcerated, we have been working with a local leader in the area who runs Tech Valley Shuttle. He has been doing a lot of the work in the various state and county jails throughout NYS to help educate and work with prisoners. We are also looking at working with programs for when people come out of prison or various hardships, to help them with interviews and their resumes.

Ceylane Meyers-Ruff – I am so happy to hear you talk about the benefits cliff. That is so important in this regard. I represent one of the Vocational Rehabilitation agencies in the state and for people with disabilities, the benefits cliff, the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program ([SNAP](#)), and [Section 8](#) are major barriers. It is extremely powerful to have the Business Council coming out on this issue.

Paul Zuber – For me and my tenure here, Heather has a strong commitment to diversifying the workforce and so do I. We are being disingenuous as an organization if not doing something that is broadening the economy for everyone. We have really been taking an active role in trying to look at things that diversify the workforce and give people opportunities who did not have opportunities before.

Anmarie Lanesey – I know there is a lot of talk about quantum and Quantum Valley. Is building quantum literacy part of your road map? How do we get this out to small businesses?

Paul Zuber – At our annual conference, one of our roundtable discussions was on AI and something I did not realize is how much AI is being used by small business. It is something that is not going away and is our responsibility going forward is determining how to train people in AI.

4. **Regional Roundtable** – One item we want to keep on the agenda is a Regional Roundtable, as time permits. Are there any initiatives or concepts that you are working on in your local areas or regions you want to share? Going forward we will leave this topic on the agenda, but today we will skip it as we are short on time.
5. **Closing Statements** – The next meeting will be held on January 22, 2025 at our new time from 1:00pm – 3:00pm in Building 12.

Adjournment

Dan McGraw motioned to adjourn the meeting, and this was seconded by Patricia Fusco at 5:05 PM.